

---

# Contents

## **Editor in Chief's Column**

*Mart Raudsaar*

**They just are with us** .....234

## ■ **RiTo conversation circle**

*Riigikogu Toimetised conversation circle*

**Who is an Estonian? A glimpse into the story of the identity of a nation** .....235

## ■ **Focus**

*Raivo Vetik*

**Two pillars of state identity** .....236

*Andres Jõesaar*

**Watching of TV channels in Estonia before and after 28 September 2015** .....236

*Ainar Ruusäär*

**Flight No 28092015** .....238

*Marko Valenta, Nihad Bunar*

**State assisted integration: Refugee integration policies in Scandinavian welfare states: the Swedish and Norwegian experience** .....239

## ■ **Politics**

*Ahto Lohjakas*

**Estonia's tethered space-time** .....239

*Alar Kilp*

**Democratic functions of populism** .....240

## ■ **Studies**

*Sirje Rist*

**Strategies of political parties for increasing the representation of women in the Riigikogu. Case study 2014** .....241

*Eneli Kindsiko, Kulno Türik*

**Women in ICT – a possible Estonian Nokia?** .....242

*Anu Toots, Tõnu Idnurm*

**To own or to rent? Housing policy choices for ageing Estonia** .....242

---

\* Peer-reviewed article

<i>Kaarel Haav</i>	
<b>Models of curriculum and development of outlets for training in the shaping of humans, citizens and specialists in Estonia*</b> .....	.243
<i>Magnus Piirits, Andres Võrk</i>	
<b>Impact of Estonian pension system reforms on intragenerational distribution of pensions*</b> .....	.244
<i>Katrin Pihor, Helena Rozeik, Miko Kupts, Mari Rell</i>	
<b>The problems faced by Estonian economy and the ways for solving them</b> .....	.245
<b>■ <i>Varia</i></b>	
<i>Mare Ainsaar</i>	
<b>European Social Survey gives answers to questions that are necessary for governing a country</b> .....	.246
<i>Tiit Toomsalu</i>	
<b>Criminal procedure reform in Estonia in 2000–2003: subsequent audit of legislation</b> .....	.246
<i>Kaia Oras, Evelin Enno</i>	
<b>Mirror of the Indicators of Sustainable Development</b> .....	.247
<i>Maige Prööm</i>	
<b>Self-regulation of the press in Europe</b> .....	.247
<i>Viljar Veebel, Illimar Ploom</i>	
<b>Purposefulness of European state aid rules from the point of view of periphery countries: Case study of Estonian Air</b> .....	.248
<b>Index of names</b> .....	.249

---

\* Peer-reviewed article

---

# Summaries

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF'S COLUMN

## They just are with us

MART RAUDSAAR,

*Editor-in-chief of Riigikogu Toimetised*

Twenty five years ago the question “Who is an Estonian?” would have been considered just an attempt of philosophical discussion aimed at shocking people. I remember the events of the Singing Revolution at the Song Festival Ground, where the people were singing “I am an Estonian and I will remain an Estonian”, and the meaning of this was unambiguously clear: opposition to the Soviet power and to the migrants, who were flowing in at an uncontrollable pace that threatened the existence of the Estonian nation.

In July 1991, at the East-West song festival Bridges of Song, several dark-skinned people could be seen at the Song Festival Ground, including a 90-year-old composer whose spiritual was performed by the joint choirs. The way we stared at them could most probably be considered impolite. However, I am sure that it was just curiosity, and not malice.

We have walked along way towards the free world, and as the Israelites wandered in the desert for forty years, it could be said that we have not really arrived yet. This wandering could also be compared to a pilgrimage where we have experienced difficulties, met different people and asked various questions about ourselves.

President Lennart Meri posed two very simple questions: “Who are we? Where are we going?”

Our identity is not a rigidly fixed phenomenon, it has gone through changes. In this issue of Riigikogu Toimetised, you can read an interesting conversation circle of the members of the Riigikogu, where the story of the formation of the identity of Estonians is discussed.

In this issue, Professor Raivo Vetik analyses the defining of the Estonian state identity among the Russian-speaking population of Estonia and the Estonians. The researchers define the state identity of the Russian-speaking population of Estonia as their social orientation, which is characterised by attaching importance to belonging among the people of Estonia, valuing the rights and obligations connected with it and adopting the important symbols of the state of Estonia. The author reaches an interesting conclusion that there are more people with strong state identity among the Russian-speaking population than among the Estonians. Another conclusion is that the respondents with strong state identity had more contacts with the representatives of other nations than the respondents with weak state identity.

This conclusion matches the essay “Estonia’s Tethered Space-Time” by Ahto Lobjakas, which the reader can also find in this issue. “...only by defining itself through an individual, opening its ground and space to the autonomy of an individual, the Estonian state can last in time and space in

today's Europe. The real strength of a state lies in the ability (and will) of freely acting individuals to reconstruct or recreate it continuously from the bottom up."

Probably it is not in the interests of the future of our country to be exclusive in the issue of what our fellow citizens should look like. But it is – thinking of the great book "Psychology of Political Struggle" by Anatoly Zimichev – very important which content we give to such universal categories as beauty, truth, welfare and prosperity. These are general human categories, but in different communities or societies their content can be very different.

### CONVERSATION CIRCLE

## Who is an Estonian? A glimpse into the story of the identity of a nation

### RIIGIKOGU TOIMETISED CONVERSATION CIRCLE

The traditional Riigikogu Toimetised conversation circle on 23 November discussed the identity of the Estonians. Mart Nutt (Pro Patria and Res Publica Union), Jüri Adams (Free Party), Aadu Must (Centre Party), Marianne Mikko (Social Democratic Party) and Martin Helme (Conservative People's Party) took part in the conversation circle. Laine Randjärv (Reform Party) sent her positions in writing.

**Martin Helme:** Each person with at least one Estonian parent or even grandparent can say that he or she is an Estonian, even if that person has dark skin or slanting eyes. But we cannot follow the model of multiculturalism or make large generalisations that an Estonian can be curly-haired and black-skinned, because then the Estonian is unrecognisably changed in comparison to what they have been during the last several thousand years.

**Aadu Must:** In the course of history, many wounded foreign soldiers have been picked up from the battlefields in Estonia.

Thanks to good Estonian women, they learned to speak Estonian. Today we have started to speak more of the civil society and not so much of the nation state. Old values naturally have to be respected, and we must never forget that the Estonian national culture is based on Christian moral and all our experiences, knowledge and education together.

**Jüri Adams:** When I was young, it was said about those who were a little different that they do not really belong among us. But by the time we restored our independence, the Estonians had become the opposite of that – all people who wanted to be with us and in whom some similarity was recognised, were considered as belonging among us. During my lifetime, I have seen the positive development that the general feeling of inferiority, which accompanied the formation of our nation, has diminished and by now it has to a great extent disappeared.

**Mart Nutt:** The formation of the Estonian nation has followed the same typical path as the formation of other nations of Central and Eastern Europe. I believe that the person who considers himself or herself an Estonian is an Estonian. Or, I am using not an objective definition of nationality, but a subjective definition of nationality, where the origin of a person is in my opinion of no importance at all.

**Marianne Mikko:** A black-skinned person holding the Estonian passport is naturally an Estonian. In my opinion, we should think about why we have lately started to use the term "guesthouse". In Võru, where I was born and grew up, there was a guesthouse, and it was a rather horrible place, because strangers, and not guests, used it. We should solve the question of what kind of Estonia we want. I believe we want a strong Estonia where the population is not smaller than it is now, with 1.3 million people. Therefore we have to be open, tolerant and accept all those who want to be among us.

**Laine Randjärv:** It seems to me that those who are interested in stimulating the fight for Estonian patriotism, which had almost come to a standstill, have today found a new “instrument” in the refugee issue. Being an Estonian is an inherent value for an Estonian. In bilingual families, where one parent is an Estonian and the other is not, children have to make a choice between being an Estonian and being something else. But I would rather like to ask – are the small interest in education and the English-language cultural space that comes to us through pop music and computer games not the things that threaten the Estonian language as such? English abbreviations and loanwords in our sentence and letters spoil our language in the same way as the Russian language used to do.

FOCUS

## **Two pillars of state identity**

**RAIVO VETIK,**

*Professor of Comparative Politics, Tallinn University School of Governance, Law and Society*

This article has two aims: to offer a theoretical approach to defining of state identity, taking into account the context of multicultural society, and to analyse the data of the latest monitoring of the integration of Estonian society in the light of such an approach. The theoretical part of the article explains the need for defining and studying state identity in terms of the neo-Weberian concept, highlighting the mutual connection between the identities of majority and minority groups in the context of the hierarchical social field. Within the framework of positivist approach, identity is regarded as an individual’s one-way psychological identification with a group or a phenomenon, but the approach based on the ideas of Max Weber sees identity more as a form of mutual

social orientation and activities of individuals. The second part of the article deals with the empirical analysis of the state identity of the Russian-speaking population of Estonia and the Estonians on the basis of the data of the latest monitoring, and brings out the connections of state identity with some important demographic characteristics, and human and social capital indicators. The analysis shows that the proportion of weak, average and strong state identity is respectively 17, 47 and 36 percent among the Russian-speakers, and respectively 24, 57 and 19 percent among the Estonians. If we consider the carriers of at least average state identity to belong among the supporters of the integration of the Estonian society, then it can be said that around 80 percent of both groups, figuratively speaking, form the two pillars on which the common ground of the Estonians and the Russian-speaking population stands in the Estonian society. Considering the historical and geopolitical context of the national relations in Estonia, it can be regarded as an adequately well-balanced system. At the same time, the analysis of the results of the monitoring also shows that the support of the state to the developing of the economic and social environment of East Virumaa should be significantly stronger.

FOCUS

## **Viewing of TV channels in Estonia before and after 28 September 2015**

**ANDRES JÕESAAR,**

*Head of Media Research Department, Estonian Public Broadcasting*

The Estonian Public Broadcasting Act sets nine goals for Estonian Public Broadcasting, and formulates eleven functions Estonian Public Broadcasting has to perform in order to achieve these

goals. Two of these are activities that contribute to increasing social cohesion of the society, and activities that assist in the promotion of the democratic form of government and, as far as possible, meet the information needs of all sections of the population, including minorities. In order to achieve these goals, Estonian Public Broadcasting creates and broadcasts various programmes that contain the factors that influence the increase of cohesion in the society and support the development of democracy. These programmes reach as many people of Estonia as possible, including all sections of the population and the minorities. This article uses two indicators for analysing the changes in the viewers of Estonian Public Broadcasting during the period from January 2003 to October 2015 – weekly reach, and the share of viewing and listening time from the general viewing/listening time. Using these indicators, it is possible to mark the trends of changes that have taken place on a timeline, and predict the capability of Estonian Public Broadcasting to fulfil the goals provided by law by extrapolating these trends into the future. The article focuses on the TV watching trends of Estonian-speaking and Russian-speaking young people (aged 4–29 years).

When we compare the viewing of TV channels among the Estonians and the viewers speaking other languages, we can see that in comparison to the level of 2003, the viewing of Estonian Public Broadcasting channels among young people speaking other languages has significantly dropped in 2015 (during the period between 1 January and 27 September 2015). Among Estonian young people, the position of Estonian Public Broadcasting was stronger, but the trend was also negative, and although the viewing of Kanal 2 and especially TV3 group of channels had dropped even more, the viewing of Estonian Public Broadcasting is still lower.

This poses the question of how to assess the effectiveness of Estonian Public Broadcasting (TV channels) in fulfilling the goals and functions provided by law in meeting the information needs of young people, especially non-Estonian young people.

The programme ETV+, which is meant for Russian-speaking audience, has been on air since 28 September 2015. The analysis of their first five weeks on air shows that the weekly reach of ETV+ is 22 percent of all viewers aged four years and older. 21.4 percent of Estonians and 23.3 percent of non-Estonians watch ETV+ in a week. The share of viewing time is 0.4 percent and 0.8 percent respectively. Thus it can be said that ETV+ has been of interest to both communities, and a relatively large part of Russian audience has found ETV+. And the weekly reach of ETV+ among Russian-speaking young people is higher than among their Estonian-speaking peers. When we compare the numbers of viewers during the period between 28 September and 8 November 2015 with the same period in 2014, we can see that a positive change has occurred in the viewing of all Estonian Public Broadcasting TV channels. The weekly reach of ETV+ among the population speaking other languages and older than four years has risen from 19.2 percent to 30.5 percent, and among the young people, from 9 percent to 14.1 percent. Thus it can be said that the downward trend of Estonian Public Broadcasting TV channels during the period between 1 January 2003 and 27 September 2015 turned to increase after the opening of ETV+, and probably the launching of ETV+ has also positively influenced the viewing of ETV and ETV2. ETV+ has been on air for only a few weeks, but it has already won a noteworthy audience. On the basis of all this, it can be said that after 28 September 2015, an important step has been taken in fulfilling the obligation of meeting the information needs of all sections of the

population, which has been imposed by law on Estonian Public Broadcasting, more effectively than before.

FOCUS

## Flight No 28092015

**AINAR RUUSSAAR,**

*Professor of Comparative Politics, Tallinn University School of Governance, Law and Society*

On 28 September at 6.55 a.m., the programme director pushed the button at the control centre of the brand new TV studio of Estonian Public Broadcasting and started the first direct broadcast of the Russian-language TV programme. The long-planned ETV+ rose into the air, with new enthusiastic pilots on board, and these pilots knew nothing yet of the number of potential passengers, and just hoped at the bottom of their hearts that the flight that had started would last a long time.

The birth of the multimedia project ETV+, aimed first of all at Russian-speaking people living in Estonia, and also all people interested in Estonia, was iconically similar to the birth of a human child. In only nine months, Estonian Public Broadcasting acquired a new studio and the necessary equipment, hired a team, developed programme formats, marketed the channel and its content as much as possible, and built up its Internet outlet. Now ETV+ can be viewed on TV screens on the whole territory of Estonia, and a large part of its programme is available all over the world via the Internet. All programmes can be watched later online.

In the planning of a Russian-language programme, Estonian Public Broadcasting did not invent a completely new spaceship, but adapted its programme logic, using the existing international models (e.g., BBC), with the aim of telling the local stories and giving the Russian-speaking

people in Estonia a possibility to debate and express their opinion freely in a TV studio. The programme logic of ETV+ is that between programmes with lighter informative content and entertainment programmes, there is a programme on local culture, a topical interview, studio debate and two daily Russian news programmes of “Aktuaalne Kaamera”. Every week, tens of different and interesting Russian-speaking people and several Estonian experts and decision-makers appear in ETV+ programmes.

Before and after its first day on air, ETV+ received many times more attention in the international press than in the domestic media. It mostly consisted in neutral news stories or mainly positive remarks, only Rossiya-1 persisted in calling the new channel an anti-Russian propaganda outlet. New Russian-language TV channel was spoken about in Broadband tv news, The Baltic Course, EUobserver, Global Post, NewEurope, New York Times, U.S. News and World Report, Yahoo News, The Christian Science Monitor, The Calvert Journal, Reuters, Deutsche Welle, Yle, Latvian LTV1 and LTV7, Kommersant, Derstandard.at, orf.at, Bayerischer Rundfunk, RTVi and many other influential media channels. Such interest is natural, because the countries of the West have for years discussed the need “to expand the Russian-language information space”, but Estonia did it.

The new Russian-language channel strongly shook the rather small Russian-language media space in Estonia – for example, the competition between the Russian journalists increased, they all had to start dealing with issues and sources more effectively than before, new Russian media publications appeared on the market. ETV+ has already written itself in the history of Estonian journalism as an important chapter. And now the length and impact of this chapter will depend on the team of this multimedia channel.

FOCUS

### **State assisted integration: Refugee integration policies in Scandinavian welfare states: the Swedish and Norwegian experience**

**MARKO VALENTA,**

*Department of Social Work and Health Science,  
Norwegian University of Science and Technology*

**NIHAD BUNAR,**

*Department of Child and Youth Studies,  
University of Stockholm*

This paper sets out to provide an analysis of refugee integration policies in Sweden and Norway, by means of comparative analysis. There is a particular focus on the ideological foundations of the Swedish and Norwegian refugee integration policies, and the main programmes drawn on by the countries' authorities in order to integrate refugees. Further, the focus is widened to identify and analyse the changes, disparities and ambiguities in the Swedish and Norwegian refugee integration policies. The paper also seeks to examine how their experience can help in understanding the limitations of extensive state assisted integration measures. It is maintained here that these Scandinavian countries have developed extensive state sponsored integration programmes of a magnitude which is unique in the European context and elsewhere, and that housing and employment assistance are the two major pillars in both Swedish and Norwegian refugee integration policies. The findings suggest that Sweden and Norway have undergone similar experiences in respect of the challenges and long term outcomes of refugee integration policy-making. Although based on the principle of a strong welfare state, which provides extensive resettlement and integration assistance to refugees, refugee

integration policies in Sweden and Norway have not succeeded in equalizing the initial inequalities between refugees and the rest of the population.

Keywords: Refugee integration, housing, employment assistance, Sweden, Norway

MS received January 2010; revised MS received April 2010

Journal of Refugee Studies Vol. 23, No. 4  
\_ The Author 2010. Published by Oxford University Press.

All rights reserved. For Permissions, please email: journals.permissions@oxfordjournals.org

doi:10.1093/jrs/feq028 Advance Access publication 10 September 2010

Downloaded from <http://jrs.oxfordjournals.org/> at Estonian National Library on October 5, 2015

POLITICS

### **Estonia's tethered space-time**

**AHTO LOBJAKAS,**

*Columnist*

The idea of Estonian nationhood was born in the 19th century in a crucible of centuries-old antagonism of German and Russian expansionism. Estonia's first, truncated stint of statehood between 1920 and 1940 left a residue of further trauma. Estonian state-building logic since 1991 has interpreted its Zeit-Spiel-Raum very restrictively, putting a premium on conserving (and manufacturing) evidence of historical legitimacy. The 1992 Constitution evokes its undemocratic 1938 predecessor, instructing the Estonian nation (riik, meaning 'state') to consider the preservation of the ethnic Estonian nation (rahvus; there are two different terms for 'nation' in Estonian) as its prime objective. This corrupted command line has stunted Estonia's vision for decades.



Modernisation is consequently limited to technocratic and technological advances. Democratic standards and the rule of law are ultimately qualified by the diktat of the needs of the (ethnic) nation state. A resulting spread of conservatism has left civic engagement levels very low, and Estonia has seen a large outflow of younger people over the past 10–15 years. 29 per cent of the population is Russian-speaking, while less than half of them hold Estonian passports. The governing political consensus regards the Russian community as a historical imposition. The rejection of Russians now poisons Estonia's coming to terms with new immigration. A whole semi-official discourse legitimising ideas of racial seclusion has emerged, with the government largely looking on as Estonia's own darker-skinned citizens suffer intensifying racist abuse and attacks.

An inheritance of German-bequeathed ersatz-Lutheranism further explains the unwillingness of the Estonian state to view development and economic expansion in modern, credit-based terms. The country's finances are in a good shape and its leaders present themselves as excellent stewards, yet governments abhor the idea of borrowing. Meanwhile, the administrative reform – long overdue in an impoverished country whose outlying areas suffer from population loss, lack of subsidies and atrophying public services – is considered almost exclusively in terms of affordability.

Unless Estonia radically expands its horizons in very short order and Europeanises its core values, it risks collapsing backwards into a spiral of historical pathology. A “Sonderweg” for Estonia will never be tenable. Such a strategy would cost the country adaptability, and its leaders any sense of agency and responsibility. The national instinct now is to maximise cohesion at the expense of all spontaneity, hoping to put off as long as possible the inevitable: a final gamble on a single desperate bid

to stave off disaster (in 1940 the Estonian leadership lacked the determination to do even that). Such a course would also alienate Estonia inexorably from its natural, Western allies.

POLITICS

## Democratic functions of populism

ALAR KILP,

*Lecturer of Comparative Politics, University of Tartu*

The article discusses the role of populism in transition to democracy and in the performance of consolidated liberal democracies. It starts with an outline of the results of the content analysis conducted by Praxis Center for Policy Studies that identified the most populist messages presented by political parties during the electoral campaign of 2015 parliamentary elections. According to the study, populist messages were used by all parliamentary parties and by four extra-parliamentary parties. The author concludes that the use of populist messages has become a general feature of electoral campaigns and a means employed by virtually all competing parties.

In their use of populist messages, the Estonian political parties are not exceptional, because the gap between populism and anti-populism has become more visible and important in the party systems of Europe and the whole world.

The key features that characterize populism are: opposition with the social and political elite; representation of the will, hopes, perceptions and fears of the people; representation of the people as a homogeneous and unitary actor; perception of crisis. Several other features that describe populism, such as promotion of direct democracy, simplifying of messages, and emotional, passionate and direct communication with the electorate, are either used by parties of other ideological

families or characterise the general type of communication between the political parties and the electorate.

Populist democracy embodies the core ideology of democracy – government for the people and by the people. Populist conceptions of democracy are indispensable in transition to democracy as well as in consolidated liberal democracy, where populism corrects, limits and balances the elitism of representative democracy, balances the liberal protection of individuals and minorities with the emphasis on the rights of majority, and provides a shared basis for the competition of values, interests and ideologies characteristic of the pluralist conception of democracy.

### STUDIES

## Strategies of political parties for increasing the representation of women in the Riigikogu Case study 2014

**SIRJE RIST,**

*Manager at NPO Abja Koolituskeskus, Master of Social Sciences*

Women's representation in the Riigikogu is low, floating at around 20%. Theoretically proven critical mass of women, which is also recommended by the United Nations, is 30%.

The question under research is whether and how the political parties represented in the Riigikogu enhance or inhibit female representation in the Riigikogu, and what strategies the parties implement. In order to achieve gender equality in political representation, the following three types of strategies (Lovenduski and Norris 1993, 8; Norris 2004, 190) are pointed out:

- ▶ Rhetorical,
- ▶ Equal opportunity policies

- ▶ Positive action policies, the so-called „positive discrimination.“

Rhetorical strategies are the weakest of the three strategies. Equal opportunity strategy is aimed at creating equal opportunities for female candidates to support women in electoral campaigning. Equal opportunity strategies can be gender-neutral by their design (Norris 2004, 191). Positive action policies strategy, the so-called “positive discrimination” is directly aimed at increasing the representation of women in elected bodies and can be summed up in the word “quotas”. Quotas can be established by law or be voluntary quotas of political parties. One part of the research is focused on the voluntary party quotas, in particular, on the zipper system, which the following four parties – the Centre Party, the Reform Party, the Pro Patria and Res Publica Union and the Social Democratic Party – have agreed to use in the memorandum signed in 2012. If all political parties used the zipper system when drawing up their election lists, as does the Centre Party, women's representation in the Riigikogu would increase. Creating equal opportunities while drawing up a common list through the implementation of a zipper system could be written into the electoral law – until all Estonian political parties are ready to implement it on a voluntary basis.

Closed lists of political parties are the main agents which help women get elected – if the parties so wish. A political recommendation to the Riigikogu is the following: not to abolish common lists for parties since this would result in lower representation of women. A suggestion for political parties is: the use of zipper method in common lists. Women's increased representation in the parliament would strengthen the attitudes supporting equality in the whole society and improve democracy.

## STUDIES

### **Women in ICT – a possible Estonian Nokia?**

**ENELI KINDSIKO,**

*Research Fellow of Qualitative Research, Faculty of Economics and Business Administration, University of Tartu*

**KULNO TÜRK,**

*Professor of Human Resource Management, Faculty of Economics and Business Administration, University of Tartu*

Skype Estonia together with the Faculty of Economics of the University of Tartu explored women's role and potential in Estonia's information and communication technology (ICT) sector.

The reason behind the study stems from the fact that the ICT sector is continuously lacking highly skilled specialists, and when looking at the current structure of ICT workforce, only around 22% of employees in the Estonian information technology industry are female. As previous studies point out, possibly the most underused and underestimated segment of specialists are females (Jürgenson *et al.* 2013). Considering the rapid growth of Estonian ICT sector, the question is how long ICT companies in Estonia can afford to leave out a significant part of potential ICT specialists just because of some wide-spread myths and associated fears?

The study took a multi-perspective view on the matter: nearly 300 high school students and ca. 100 ICT students were surveyed to gain an insight into their beliefs, motivation, and choices; besides that, 18 in-depth interviews with 18 female students, employees, and leaders in the ICT sector were conducted. The aim of the study was to find out why there are disproportionally less females pursuing a career in ICT.

The results revealed that even in the 21st century females are highly influenced by cultural beliefs and gender-specific

stereotypes. To be more specific, it was possible to bring out six wide-spread myths that keep ICT out of the girls' career choice:

1. ICT is for long-haired boys;
2. ICT people are anti-social and geeky;
3. ICT work equals programming or fixing computers;
4. ICT is only for those who are strong in mathematics and hold a diploma in ICT;
5. There are boys' fields and girls' fields;
6. Women have to be "helped" into ICT.

## STUDIES

### **To own or to rent? Housing policy choices for ageing Estonia**

**ANU TOOTS, TÕNU IDNURM,**

*Tallinn University, School of Governance, Law and Society*

In the nearest future, the ageing of population will make the policy shapers face the question: will the housing used by the aged correspond to their possibilities and needs in the future? If not, then should everyone solve their problem individually, or is it necessary to formulate a national housing policy supporting smart choices? One of the possibilities for state intervention is to develop the public rented housing sector, which so far has had low political priority. In 2015, a web poll was conducted to study the attitude of 50+ population towards public rented housing sector. 1352 persons from all over Estonia who were older than 50 years responded to the questionnaire.

The results of the poll showed that renting of housing is not widespread among the age group of 50+ at present, and there is little personal experience with it. In 74 percent of cases, the housing belonged to the respondent or their family, 3.7 percent lived in a rented flat and only 0.4 percent had subleased their

housing. Most of the respondents are satisfied with their tenure and had lived there for more than 15 years. Thus most of the respondents have no direct need for changing their housing. On the other hand, the poll showed that the support for public rented housing sector is high among the 50+ population and very many aged people are ready for several changes related to their housing.

The behavioural strategies of the respondents can be divided into three categories. The most popular strategy (75 percent of respondents) was exchanging present housing for another when it becomes too costly or maintaining it is too burdensome. This behaviour strategy is possible also under the conditions of the present housing market, and does not require any new or more intensive housing policy measures. Other behavioural choice—to sell one's property and become a tenant—divided those who had participated in the poll into two more or less equal groups. 46 percent do not want to live in a rented flat, 54 percent are ready to sell their present housing and start renting a flat. The most widespread motive for changing the status of an owner for the status of a tenant was the hope to improve one's material welfare, maybe with the help of regulative intervention of the state. A little more than one third expressed fear that one day they may not be able to pay their rent. Here the state should come to help by providing housing in cases of emergency and also regulating the rent prices. The third strategy—becoming a lessor—was a possible behavioural choice for a small part of 50+ persons. 5 percent of respondents were ready to take a lessee unconditionally, 61 percent said a firm “no”, the main reason was not trusting people. The main motive which makes the aged consider renting out excessive space is problems with maintaining the housing, caused by their bad health. Generally the target group is little aware of the possibility to become a lessor, but the potential of such an option

in improving the quality of life of the aged visibly exists.

Until now, the housing needs of young families have been on the agenda of Estonian politics, but the ageing of population forces to diversify policy choices so that they would include also options suitable for the aged.

### STUDIES

## **Models of curriculum and development of outlets for training in the shaping of humans, citizens and specialists in Estonia**

*KAAREL HAAV,*

*Doctor of Psychology, educational sociologist, expert of curricula*

The article discusses the main models of curriculum and the outlets for training in general and higher education in Estonia and the EU. The author develops the existing lists of the outlets for training in higher education into a hierarchical system, connecting them to the main aim and outlet: the shaping of a human, a citizen and a specialist. Sub-aims make the main aspects of this development one-dimensional and measurable (for example, knowledge of the main subjects, their terminology and theories). Connecting the knowledge in a subject with the main aim requires understanding the nature of and mutual links between such concepts as human, society and culture. Culture and human knowledge are by their nature symbolic and conventional. All different curricula, sciences and subjects deal with various aspects of humans, society, culture and nature. Further, more intense and integrated comprehension of these connections shows the level of development.

In order to acquire these general and specialised cognitive notions, it

is necessary to establish connections between them and other forms of perception, learning, communication and activity. Consistent using and mutually interconnecting of these different forms ensures the diverse development of the learner's skills. The article focuses on elaborating these two main ideas. The author has developed and implemented this concept in his practice, in studies with students, in reports, research works, presentations and publications.

## STUDIES

# Impact of Estonian pension system reforms on intragenerational distribution of pensions<sup>1,2</sup>

MAGNUS PIIRITS,

*Analyst, PRAXIS Center for Policy Studies, PhD Student at the University of Tartu*

ANDRES VÕRK,

*Analyst, PRAXIS Center for Policy Studies, Lecturer at the University of Tartu*

During the last two decades, several important reforms have been carried out in the Estonian pension system. Changes in pension system have a long-term impact; therefore it is necessary to predict the outcome of changes for a long time. The article analyses the impact of pension system reforms on intragenerational inequality, and discusses how the inequality of pensions will change in the future due to the introduction of the insurance component depending on salary (in 1999) and mandatory funded pension (in 2002)

<sup>1</sup> Peer-reviewed article

<sup>2</sup> This article is a shortened Estonian version of an article in English: Võrk, A., Piirits, M., Jõgi, E. (2015). "The Impact of Introduction of Funded Pension Schemes on Intragenerational Inequality in Estonia: a Cohort Microsimulation Analysis". Longer Estonian version can be read in the blog of Praxis Center for Policy Studies (<http://mottetohmik.praxis.ee/>). The English version of the article is connected with the MOPACT (Mobilising Potential Active Aging) project, which was financed from

into the national pension scheme. Today, the old age pensions in Estonia are among the most equal in Europe, i.e. in comparison to the rest of Europe, the pensions in Estonia are more alike. The purpose of this article is to find out and show how great the inequality of pensions will be after the large-scale pension system reforms which made the size of pension to a great extent dependent on the size of salary.

The analysis uses the real data of men born in 1980. The data have been provided by the Social Insurance Board and have been made anonymous. The sample consists of 10,286 men. The sizes of old age pensions have been calculated on the basis of the scenarios of four reforms and using the dynamic distribution of salaries.

In 2013, the inequality of the income of pensioners in Estonia was small (Gin coefficient was 0.1) and the replacement rate of pensions was modest (around 40 percent). On the basis of this article, it became clear that that replacing of the component depending on the length of working time (before 1999) by the insurance component depending on salary in 1999 and establishing of the 2nd pillar in 2002 will increase the inequality of pensioners retiring in the future. Gin coefficient of simulated pensions of those who will retire in 2045 increases from the level 0.1 to the level 0.27. Reform of the changing of pension index (since 2008) reduces the inequality of pensions, because the base amount, which is equal for everybody, increases faster than the value of the insurance component. As a result of this reform, Gin coefficient will be a little lower – by 0.03. On the other hand, the inequality of the replacement rate of pensions will also be lower due to the pension reforms, because pensions are more and more closely connected with the contributions of persons.

If the formation of pension is closely connected with salary, it may bring the inequality of future pensions to an unreasonable level in such a country like

Estonia, where the differences of salaries are great, unemployment rate is high and many people use the possibility of receiving an early retirement pension. The easiest way of reducing this inequality is to increase the re-distribution of the 1st pillar (e.g., increase the growth of base amount even more or, by way of an exception, to raise the level of base amount). Establishing a ceiling on social tax would also reduce the inequality of pensions, because then the persons whose salary is especially high would no longer earn such a large insurance component, and their payments to the 2nd pillar would also be smaller.

STUDIES

**The problems faced by Estonian economy and the ways for solving them**

KATRIN PIHOR, HELENA ROZEIK, MIKO TAMMIK, MARI RELL  
*PRAXIS analysts*

Estonia has set itself the objective to achieve 80 percent of the average level of productivity<sup>3</sup> of the EU by 2020. Although the increase of the productivity of Estonian labour force has been faster than the average in Europe, in recent years the growth rate has slowed down significantly and the achieving of this objective has become unlikely.

In the article, we discuss what the main problems are and what the sources of the increase of productivity could be in order to avoid Estonia's getting into the so-called medium income trap. Increase of productivity is influenced by several factors; we focus on three of them: development of technology, knowledge-based entrepreneurship and business environment favourable to enterprises.

One of the reasons of low productivity is that the structure of Estonian economy and export is still inclined towards production with low added value and the Estonian entrepreneurs are still too dependent on labour-intensive activities. Although the percentage of innovative enterprises in Estonia is at the same level as the EU average, most of them are connected with process innovations, and by product, organisation or marketing innovation we are clearly below the EU average. As a solution, the article highlights the need for cooperation and knowledge transfer between enterprises (especially SMEs) and research institutions, expanding the use of ICT in all spheres of business, increase of the sale capabilities of enterprises and supporting the upwards movement in value chain.

As the second important challenge, the article points at the need to find solutions for helping the early stage entrepreneurs reach the stage of developed entrepreneurship, especially taking into account the ambitions of early entrepreneurship in regard to innovation and internationalisation. The solutions the article proposes are the following: developing entrepreneurship attitudes and skills, extending the availability of capital and supporting innovation.

The third problem the article discusses is the impact of the tax system on the creation of jobs, asking the question whether it is time for Estonia to think of imposing higher taxation on property. The impact of possible changes of social tax is also dealt with.

<sup>3</sup> Calculated as added value per employee.

VARIA

## European Social Survey gives answers to questions that are necessary for governing a country

MARE AINSAAR,

*Head of Chair of Social Policy, University of Tartu, Coordinator of European Social Survey in Estonia*

The article gives an overview of the activities of the European Social Survey in Estonia in 2004–2015. Collecting of data for the European Social Survey started in Estonia in 2004. Estonia has participated in all subsequent rounds of study. New data for the survey are collected every two years. The survey has turned out to be very successful both by the great number of users and also by the number of publications based on the survey in Estonia. 1200 people use the data of the survey in Estonia, which is the second result per 1000 people in the world after Slovakia. In 2015, every three days an article about Estonia was published in international cooperation in every three days. The article gives an overview of the activities and principles that have been taken into account in conducting the survey and have contributed to its success. These include, first of all, open use of the data, training of users, and clear and user-friendly web output. For example, in 2012–2015, there were 39 special trainings for 1780 persons in Estonia. The results of the survey are valuable in making decisions for governing the country. A short overview of analyses that deal with two issues and were written on the basis of the data of the survey is given as an example of the usefulness of the European Social Survey in governing a country. The themes of these analyses are “Stable and Successful State” and “Economic Growth, Social Relations and Welfare”.

(The European Social Survey (ESS)  
<http://www.europeansocialsurvey.org/>)

VARIA

## Criminal procedure reform in Estonia in 2000–2003: subsequent audit of legislation

TIIT TOOMSALU,

*Member of the 9th Riigikogu, entrepreneur*

The correlation between the quantitative and qualitative indicators of legislation has been in the focus of attention of Estonian politicians for a long time. Quantitative indicators were considered a priority in legislative activities during the period when Estonia was preparing for the membership of the European Union. The reason for this was the need to realise the principle of *acquis communautaire*. After the accession, the quality of legislation, or transition from the conveyor method of legislation to impact assessment and measuring the social feedback of legislation, has been emphasised as a priority at various levels of high authority.

Priorities aimed at the quality of legislation require the implementation of a relevant mechanism in the organisation of work of the legislative body. Generally speaking, there is no such mechanism. The attention of the legislator is still focused on new legislative initiatives, and not on assessing the impact of what has been done.

In order to illustrate the need for the audit of legislative impacts, the author discusses in retrospect a specific reforming Act, the Code of Criminal Procedure, which was passed several years ago. The academic debates before and after the reform, dissenting opinions on the effectiveness of the reform during the legislative proceedings stage of the Bill, the expected purposes of the Bill, social feedback after a decade had passed from the implementation of the reforms, and assessment of achieving the aims that were set have been touched upon.

The author is of the opinion that the purposes that were expected from the reform Act have not been realised. The reform has not brought about the increase of legal certainty or optimisation of the burden of judicial system. Transition from the continental European inquisitorial model of criminal procedure to the American competitive model has resulted in the domination of subjectivity and decline of objective evidence in court practice. The solutions of criminal procedures are losing their credibility and are not guarantees for legal peace.

As a former member of the Riigikogu who knows the organisation of work of the Parliament, the author is of the opinion that it is possible to raise the quality of legislation by making legislative audit a part of the practice of the legislator. Auditing activity does not require changing the existing organisational structure of the Riigikogu. Defining of this function in the Riigikogu Rules of Procedure and Internal Rules Act would provide relevant organisational framework.

VARIA

### **Mirror of the indicators of sustainable development**

**KAIA ORAS,**

*Deputy Head of Economic and Environmental Statistics Department, Statistics Estonia*

**EVELIN ENNO,**

*Leading Specialist, Economic and Environmental Statistics Department, Statistics Estonia*

The national strategy for sustainable development “Sustainable Estonia 21”, approved by the Riigikogu in 2005, determines how Estonia has planned to contribute to the sustainability of development. The trends of the indicators of sustainable development reflect how the strategy has been implemented in Estonia.

During one decade of implementing the sustainable development strategy, the significant trends in many spheres of sustainable development have improved in Estonia, and several targets have been reached. But there are also fields where the level of more successful Member States of the European Union, that are constantly moving ahead, has not been reached. The issue of sustainable development has again become relevant in the world, because in 2015, the UN adopted the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and its goals.

VARIA

### **Self-regulation of the press in Europe**

**MAIGE PRÖÖM,**

*Acting Secretary, Estonian Press Council*

Self-regulation of the press is important to the consumers of the media, so that they could interfere in the case of the errors of the journalists. The principles and bodies of self-regulation have been created by the media itself, among other things, they include the Code of Press Ethics and the bodies that monitor the observance of the rules and the Code.

Self-regulation of the press is generally similar in the European countries. There are differences in details, like whether an individual is preferred over agencies and organisations, the ability of the self-regulation body to initiate cases by itself, or in a wider context – is there a press council in the country at all. Surprisingly, there are several countries that do not have a self-regulation body, and they include also Latvia and Lithuania.

In the sphere of self-regulation, Estonia has learned a lot from Finland, but we differ by the fact that in Finland all citizens who find that good journalistic practices have been violated can submit a complaint. At the same time, the complainant must have the consent of the person whom the



published material directly concerns. In Estonia, the Press Council cannot start an investigation by itself, but the Press Council of Finland has that possibility.

Natural or legal persons who want to submit a complaint on the material published about them in the media can turn to the Estonian Press Council. The time limit in Estonia is three months from the publishing of the material. As regards condemning decisions, Clause 1.4 of the Code of Press Ethics, according which the publication is responsible for not publishing incorrect, distorted or misleading information, and Clause 4.2, according to which the journalist has to hear both sides when publishing material containing a conflict, have been violated the most.

VARIA

## **Purposefulness of European state aid rules from the point of view of periphery countries: Case study of Estonian Air**

*VILJAR VEEBEL,*

*Associate Professor, Estonian National Defence College*

*ILLIMAR PLOOM,*

*Lecturer, Ragnar Nurkse School of Innovation and Governance at Tallinn University of Technology and European College of University of Tartu*

The main purpose of the European Union state aid regulations is to guarantee free and undistorted competition, therefore granting of state aid is usually disapproved. Only a few exceptions are allowed, which should ensure greater common interest and security. Unfortunately, location in the periphery or low population density do not belong among such exceptions. Using state support to help less developed regions catch up with others is allowed in certain cases, but it has never had an important role in the European Commission's decisions on aviation.

Although in terms of the interests of the European Union as a whole, competition policy and the state aid regulation that forms part of it have been implemented with success, the problems accompanying it have become the burden of small and peripheral countries. If we want the citizens of these countries to continue supporting integration and common regulations, the economic and legislative bases of state aid should be thoroughly considered, taking into account the different environments of countries. The economic gains of some countries should not come at the expense of others, and the governments of Member States should be motivated for cooperation, and not for confrontation, in their relations with the European Commission. The traditional role of the state to provide its citizens the services the market does not offer should also be considered. At the same time, the inclination of politicians to seek popularity among the voters by generously distributing state resources should not be forgotten either.

In practice, the harsh and uniform restrictions have most of all influenced the aviation sector, in particular the national airlines located in the periphery of the European Union. Certainly the case of Estonian Air will provide important matter for analysis in the issues mentioned above. However, the problems in the aviation sector point at a wider problem of the competitiveness of periphery countries, where it has been possible to sustainably provide certain socially necessary services that are important for the integrated development of economy only with the support of the state. It is necessary to search for solutions for how the periphery countries could get the service they need without distorting the general situation of competitiveness shaped by large companies. Distortion of the market and wasting of taxpayers' money should be avoided, but at the same time it is necessary to maintain strategic connections.