

Summaries

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF'S COLUMN

Our People, Our State and Our Space **Mart Raudsaar**, Editor-in-chief of Riigikogu Toimetised The key to the survival of the state of Estonia is the good relations between the Estonians and Russians living here. It is the task of the younger generation of Russians living in Estonia to shape the identity of local Russians. True, every year the city of Narva is losing more than a thousand of its citizens, as we can read in the essay written by Karin Raig, the Director of Narva College of the University of Tartu. During the last quarter of a century the population of the town has decreased by one fourth. Young people are leaving, either for Tallinn or in most cases abroad. But those who stay should not be distrusted only because Russia, that in spring occupied Crimea (which very much resembles the events in the Baltic States in 1940s) and invaded East Ukraine, has become aggressive towards its neighbours. Part of our Russians live in a different information space, as we can read in the article by Triin Vihalemm and other researchers of the University of Tartu. They may support Putin's activities in Russia and Ukraine, but this does not mean that they support separatism in Estonia. They may need the Estonian Russian-language TV channel Andres Jõesaar writes about. As the Member of the Board of Estonian Public Broadcasting Company Ainar Ruusaaar says: we are not creating a channel for counter-propaganda, we are giving the Russians of Estonia a possibility to speak about the issues of their community to their community. The representatives of the parties in the Riigikogu discuss the security situation in the conversation circle. Besides demography, social affairs and security, this issue of Riigikogu Toimetised also tells about Estonia's efforts to become a full member of the European Space Agency. There is also an article about e-elections, written by Kristjan Vassil and the researches of the University of Tartu; the ethic principles of the drafting of the budget of Tallinn and the interests of nation states in the European Union are also discussed. Riigikogu Toimetised continues its efforts to bring together political and scientific thinking, maybe in a more focused form than before, concentrating also on the nationally important issues of the moment. During recent months, the Chancellery of the Riigikogu and the Board of Riigikogu Toimetised have had discussions on reforming the concept and outlook of the journal. The reform of the content was gradually started already in the previous issue published in the first half of this year, now we are dealing with the appearance of Riigikogu Toimetised. The next issue of Riigikogu Toimetised – no 31 – will be in full colour. Riigikogu Toimetised is still a paper publication. But it is already being discussed what the journal could look like in the web, and this is connected with the new web solution of the Riigikogu, which will be ready next year. It is understandable that we have to be where the people are – and more and more of our readers, especially the younger generation, are in the digital world.

ESSAY

A Western Approach to Our Narva **Katri Raik**, Director, Narva College of the University of Tartu There are not many places where Russia would be so close to Europe as in Narva: one only needs to cross the river. Narva is namely a twin town. Its counterpart, Ivangorod, is situated on the other bank and belongs to the Russian Federation. Fortresses build in the High Middle Ages and in the Late

Middle Ages are landmarks of both towns, one symbolizing West, the other one – East. Narva is situated on the border of the European Union, as a gate that for some people is the end of Europe and for others – the beginning. Narva is a town with a rapidly decreasing population. However, a population of 60,000 people still makes it the third largest city in Estonia. Narva can probably also be considered a town with the highest Russianspeaking population in the European Union, as 97% of people living here speak that language. Starting April this year, when Crimea was occupied, journalists began flocking to Narva from near and far. Many were searching for a place in Europe where the events of Crimea could repeat themselves. It should be mentioned here that the locals do not believe such a scenario plausible. Even those that support Putin's Ukraine policy. Journalists are often stuck in stereotypes, so it takes a lot of effort for the locals to somehow make them doubt their petrified ideas. News people are looking for possible separatist attitudes in the city and if riots are to be feared. They ask questions about conflicts based on nationality, language, and citizenship, ask about the life in the town. It is the low income and a certain degree of insecurity regarding Narva's future that make people worry the most. Even this spring people still believed that the life of Narva can be changed thanks to the tourists from Saint-Petersburg as the city is situated 140 km away from Narva. By today the flow of tourists has grown smaller, first and foremost due the purchasing power of the rouble diminishing. The journalists visiting Narva mostly want to find out if the life in the town has changed since the outbreak of the Crimea conflict. People of Narva have different opinions, and one can find all sorts of attitudes here. However, everybody in Narva, whatever their language and outlook, is currently a bit tired of the constant attention that was triggered by the situation in Ukraine. People want to live their daily lives. But just like any border area, Narva, that serves as a kind of gate to Europe, requires attention. First and foremost from its own state.

POLITICS

Security Policy: Election Horse or Consensus?

Riigikogu Toimetised conversation circle Representatives of all the factions in the Riigikogu took part in the November panel of the Riigikogu Toimetised to discuss whether there was a need to reach a consensus in security issues before the upcoming parliamentary elections. **Mati Raidma** represented the Reform Party, **Urmas Reinsalu** – the Pro Patria and Res Publica Union, **Enn Eesmaa** – the Centre Party, and **Marianne Mikko** – the Social Democratic Party. They were interviewed by **Mart Raudsaar**, the Editor-in-Chief of the Riigikogu Toimetised. The theses of the panelists are briefly summarised below. **Mati Raidma**: As far as the national security is concerned, the government has laid out a ten year plan. Here we have an opportunity to shape a consensus between the political parties. We should concentrate on integrated national security capacities. I think that it is vital for the Riigikogu to proceed and to pass a National Defence Act that lays out the new principle of broad national defence. Every Estonian resident can contribute to the national defence according to their abilities. **Urmas Reinsalu**: A consensus already exists on that defence expenditure must form two per cent of the GDP; secondly, the principle of a reserve army is also based on a consensus; thirdly, there is consensus on the existence of the Defence League as one of the components of the national defence, as well as on developing professional defence forces and on efficient contribution to foreign missions. Concerning the ten year plan, it is

important to discuss whether Estonia should achieve certain capacities earlier. We must deal with issues of information war. Marianne Mikko: Consensus on maintaining national interests and the national security is elementary. In security issues, it would not be wise to bring everything we know into our election campaigns. We should not be obsessed with our opponents and their strengths. Instead, we should work on developing our capacities and harmonise these with our allies. The percentage of women in voluntary military service should be increased to around ten per cent. Cyber security is an important issue. Enn Eesmaa: All larger political factions in Estonia have reached a fairly gratifying consensus in foreign and security policy issues during the period between the elections. It would be important for parties to achieve consensus in these issues after the elections as well, regardless of their status as part of the government or the opposition. Cyber security is a very important issue and the relevant activities should be amply funded. I would also invest in a local level Russian language media that can tell the local audience about local events.

Estonia's security in the debate of the Foreign Affairs Committee ¹

Marko Mihkelson, Chairman of the Foreign Affairs Committee of the Riigikogu (Pro Patria and Res Publica Union) At the time when European security is being threatened by Russia's aggressiveness, the expansion of Islamic extremism, cyber terrorism, the shortage of resources, and poverty migration, Estonia's security can be secured above all by a more coherent society and an internationally competitive economy. The speech by the Russian President Vladimir Putin at the Munich Conference on Security Policy in February 2007 can be regarded as a pivotal moment in the recent history of the European security system. Russia's withdrawal from the Treaty on Conventional Armed Forces in Europe, aggression against Georgia, and many other changes in the wider security environment prompted the Foreign Affairs Committee of the Riigikogu to launch extended hearings on the security of the Nordic and Baltic region in 2012. The time limit was set as until 2020. Regrettably, Russia's aggression against Ukraine and occupation and annexation of Crimea have followed. The Foreign Affairs Committee of the Riigikogu has commissioned the study "Developments in the Security Environment of the Nordic and Baltic Sea Region up to 2020" from the International Centre for Defence Studies by intermediation of the Chancellery of the Riigikogu. The recommendations of the report stress the achievement of the political and defence presence of NATO and first of all the USA as the main security guarantor of this region. The report stresses that it is in Estonia's interests to maintain a balance between the conventional weapons, ballistic missile defence and tactical nuclear weapons. In order to retain our deterrence ability, we must improve the preparedness, the positioning and the capability of the Northern European military forces. In addition to the abovementioned study, in more than two years, the Foreign Affairs Committee has organised 44 hearings concerning the field of security. Besides that, sittings have been held at the NATO Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence, the Information Board and Tallinn maritime rescue centre, regular sittings together with the National Defence Committee have been held at the General Staff of the Defence Forces, and a visit to international exercises has taken place. The National Security Concept prepared by the Government of the Republic is a central framework document of Estonian foreign and security policy. The last updated version of this document dates from 2010.

Especially in recent years, changes that require the reviewing and amending of the National Security Concept of Estonia have taken place directly in our security environment and in the security environment of the whole Europe on a wider scale. Sharpness of strategic thinking together with a continuously improving actual implementing plan of policies form the foundation for strengthening Estonia's broad-based national defence. Estonia should direct the European Union to concentrate more on strategic thinking. We must develop a strategic culture in the European Union that would allow for early, rapid and, if necessary, powerful intervention. It cannot be excluded that Russia's aggressive and opposing stance to Western countries will last for some time. Therefore, it is very important for Estonia to ensure the permanent presence of allied forces and at the same time to secure political consensus of the allies. ¹ The article is based on Marko Mikhelson's speech at the security debate in the Riigikogu on 16 October 2014.

Estonia Begins with Ida-Virumaa

Aimar Altosaar, Adviser at the Ministry of Internal Affairs After the Soviet occupation Ida-Virumaa has become a county that lags behind the Estonian average both in its social and economic development. The population of this region is one of the fastest declining and ageing in Estonia; besides that, different social and ethnic-cultural groups are mutually little integrated and the region as a whole has also remained alien to other regions of the country. Before World War II, the eastern part of Virumaa was a prosperous and idyllic region with highly developed agriculture and industry, especially textile industry and oil shale chemistry. The region had many cultural and historic monuments, like the Baroque old town of Narva, and an internationally known resort Narva-Jõesuu. The number of population before World War II was under one hundred thousand, but after the war had ended, there were only some tens of thousands of people. In this region of Estonia, the Soviet power implemented especially intensive colonial policy, and according to the census of 1989, there were 221,111 people living in Ida-Virumaa; only 40,836 of them, or 18%, were Estonian. By 2014, the population of the county has decreased by a third because in addition to the returning of immigrants, there has been a steady migration to Tallinn and Harjumaa, and to a lesser extent to other Member States of the European Union. On 1 January 2014, there were 149,483 people living in the county, 19.5% of them were Estonians. The percentage of non-Estonians who can speak the official language of Estonia and use it on a daily basis has up to now remained modest. The Government of the Republic has dedicated special attention to the region since the first days after the restoration of independence. Generally, the activities of the state power in Ida-Virumaa can be divided into the following periods: political integration in the beginning of the 1990s; economic stabilisation in the second half of the 1990s; restructuring of economy and investing from the turn of the century to economic crisis. A new period began in 2010, when the Ida-Virumaa action plan for 2010–2014 was drawn up under the direction of the Ministry of Internal Affairs. In the new action plan for 2015–2020, the experience of the previous action period has been taken into account and new priorities are set. 1. To increase the presence of the state in Ida-Virumaa visibly, convincingly and permanently. 2. To promote entrepreneurship by making necessary investments to the infrastructure of industrial and logistics parks and keeping the level of taxation in balance between private and public interests. 3. To create a diverse living environment that enables

active way of life. To promote the development of community spirit and regional identity among all groups of population. 4. To guarantee better quality and availability of health care and social security measures. 5. To strengthen internal security by staffing the agencies of relevant fields and equipping them with the best technology, and also by developing psychological and informational defence capacity. The action plan that is being prepared will show how the government will amend the existing situation in 2015–2020 and establish conditions for making Ida-Virumaa a dynamically developing region that is coherently connected with the rest of Estonia, and characterised by diverse and high-quality living environment and highly productive economy. The action plan will devote great attention to the reputation of the county, and the activities that are connected with internal and external security of the state. In order to ensure internal security, it is necessary to have well-motivated personnel and technical conditions corresponding to the requirements of today; in order to ensure external security, it is necessary to pay more attention to the development of social and intellectual environment.

Rhetoric of Estonian population policy, comparison with Europe

Mare Ainsaar, Head of Chair, Senior Research Fellow in Sociology and Social Policy at the University of Tartu The article compares the population policy attitudes expressed by Estonia and by another 30 European countries. The article defines population policy in a narrower demographic sense. We discuss population policy as a policy that intends to change the population figures through either birth rate or migration. Health policy is left out of the analyses because there is not a single state in Europe that is not working towards reducing mortality. Ten indicators from the UN Population Policy Database of 2001–2013 serve as a basis for comparison. We compare the consolidated data of national attitudes to the demographic situation in these states. The analysis of national attitudes is based on assessment and policy index. The “assessment” index gives a concise expression to national attitudes vis-à-vis the population situation. The “policy” index summarises the national rhetoric on the need to implement specific policies. As far as population growth and structure are concerned, Estonia is among the most disadvantaged states in Europe. States that have a more critical assessment of their population situation also support population growth policies more strongly, at least at the level of rhetoric. Over the past ten years, Estonia has been a fairly average European state in supporting population growth policy. Birth rate has been the priority of Estonia's population policy along with health policy. Estonia lacks any emigration policy and has been cautious in promoting immigration policy for various reasons.

Inter-generation effects of Estonian pension system*

Magnus Piirits, Foundation PRAXIS Centre for Policy Studies, Junior Analyst Over the last 15 years, the pension system in Estonia has undergone multiple reforms, such as the introduction of the social tax dependent 1st pillar, the introduction of the 2nd and 3rd pillars, or the raising of the retirement age. Every reform leads to changes for the beneficiaries of the system. The changes similarly affect the pension system where reforms have caused changes both within the confines of one generation and between generations. This article focuses on the inter-

generation effects of the pension system and is a brief summary of a 2014 Master's thesis from the University of Tartu. The main message of the article is that the individuals from younger generations, whose salary level is average or above it, will most likely receive a larger pension than individuals of the same salary level in older generations. This is a result of the future pensions increasingly depending on individual salaries, as well as of the younger generations making larger payments in the pension system, and over longer periods. On the other hand, the individuals from younger generations whose salary level is below average will receive a smaller pension than the earlier generations, although their payments to the pension system are larger compared to the individuals with the same salary level from the older generations. This analysis mainly uses the internal rate of return to assess payments to and from the system; the rate is usually applied to assessing the profitability of investment projects. Another criterion is the net present value ratio (NPVR). The analysis also uses pension replacement rates in comparison to the average salary and the actual salary of the individual at the time of retiring as well as ten years later. The analysis uses a simulation method to assess the intergeneration effects on equal grounds. The results of the study suggested that the reforms have made the pension system more actuarial, as the internal profitability between salary levels within generations has become more uniform; this means that people receive a result, i.e. a pension, that corresponds better to their contribution. The benefit of working longer does not depend as much on the generation as on the salary level. Therefore, if the retirement age is to be raised universally, the individuals from every generation who receive an above average salary will also receive the highest replacement rate. At the same time, working longer reduces the internal rate of return more pronouncedly in older generations than the younger ones. * Peer reviewed research paper.

Analysis of the Effects of Benefits to Families with Children on Poverty and Work Incentives

Andres Võrk, Analyst, PRAXIS Centre for Policy Studies, Lecturer at the University of Tartu **Cenely Leppik**, Analyst, PRAXIS Centre for Policy Studies **Alari Paulus**, Research Fellow, University of Essex This article gives an overview of the research project “The effects of family benefits and financing of early childhood education and care”, which was initiated by the Ministry of Social Affairs and the Ministry of Education and Science, and was carried out by Praxis Center for Policy Studies. The research was supported by the Government Office’s Fund of Wise Decisions and the European Social Fund. The purpose of the study was to conduct a comparative quantitative analysis of family policy instruments in order to find policy measures that most effectively reduce poverty among children and at the same time do not discourage the labour supply of parents. The study focused on cash benefits and subsidized child care services. The microsimulation model EUROMOD with data from the Estonian Social Survey 2011 was used to simulate the impact of various policy changes on the absolute and relative poverty measures, budgetary expenditures and marginal effective tax rates for the year 2015. The study ranks policy changes according to their cost-effectiveness in poverty reduction and impact on work incentives. The results of the study were used as an input for the government's green paper on family benefits and services. The study highlights that Estonian social policy targets various poverty rates and applies different income thresholds for means-tested benefits. Different income thresholds apply

slightly different methods to find households' equivalised incomes. Hence there is no direct match between the targets and instruments of social policy. The study included about a hundred different hypothetical policy simulations and analysed their effect on government budget and poverty. The most cost-effective policy measures to reduce absolute poverty among children were changes in subsistence benefits; either additional top-ups for families with children or increasing child's weight in the formula of subsistence benefits. This is followed by an increase in means-tested family benefits. About 90% of additional expenditures that occur due to these policy measures go to families with children below absolute poverty risk threshold (125% of absolute poverty line). Increase in benefits for single-parent households with means-testing is also cost-effective – about 60% of the benefits go to households below absolute poverty risk threshold. The impact of benefits on labour supply incentives was measured by marginal effective tax rates (METR), which show how much of additionally earned gross wage is taxed away with a combination of increased taxes and reduced social benefits. In Estonia, negative labour supply incentives for low-wage earners arise mainly from subsistence benefits and means-tested family benefits. It means that additional increases of either subsistence benefits or means-tested family benefits would reduce labour supply incentives for certain income range even more. On the other hand increasing universal child benefits would not have such effect on labour supply.

Ethical Value Judgements in the Budget Books of the Tallinn City Government for 1934–2013

Lea Roostalu, Doctoral Student, Estonian Business School **Mari Kooskora**, Associate Professor, Estonian Business School **Tarmo Kadak**, Associate Professor, Tallinn University of Technology Using qualitative content analysis, this case study examined the indications of sustainability in the budget books of the Tallinn City Government during the first independence period of the Republic of Estonia (I), the period of occupation (II) and after the restoration of independence (III). The content analysis model is based on the Talcott Parsons's AGIL scheme, where the respective dimensions are the four components of Estonia's sustainable development strategy SE21: ecological balance (A), growth of welfare (G), coherent society (I) and the vitality of Estonian cultural space (L). Parsons considered the last dimension, or values (L), the most important for ensuring consistency. In addition, according to the experts involved in the development of strategy SE21, the vitality of the Estonian cultural room as well as social cohesion have a strong influence on the implementation of the strategy, meaning that these two dimensions, which are related to and intensify one another, have a focal role in the coming period. The study's results reveal that the budget books originating from the first independence period of the Republic of Estonia are characterised by a high level of orientation to sustainability in all dimensions. However, in the occupation period there was a decline in all fields – the orientation of culture and cohesion to sustainability was found to be extremely low and only the occurrence of ecological balance indications was satisfactory. Although the indicators have improved significantly during the period of regained independence, the results of the first period have not been achieved yet, especially with regard to social cohesion. One of the indicators of a coherent society is ensuring transparency, which was non-existent during the occupation period and is twice as low in the third than in the first period. The results of the study indicate that there was no balance between

the dimensions of the Parsons' AGIL scheme either in the second or the third period. Therefore, the local government must intensify complete approach of sustainability, paying special attention to common values and social cohesion. Tönnisson, who examined Estonian local governments, also finds that Estonia is characterised by the slow development of civil society and that the Estonian public sector does not have a clearly developed value system, which is why a more serious approach should be taken for creating and promoting values. Acknowledgement. This research project was supported by the Business Ethics Grant of the Swedbank.

Interests of EU Member States vs Unified Europe

Laine Randjärv, First Vice-President of the Riigikogu The article discusses how to find a balance between the national interests of the EU Member States and the unified Europe. Some countries express doubts regarding the profitability of being part of the EU, while the pessimists among the analysts predict an imminent break-up of the Union. The author believes that we can avoid the pessimistic scenario, but this will require paying more attention to the balance between the common policy of the EU and the interests of the Member States. The author considers the common energy policy, the Trans-European Transport Network and the smooth functioning of the common market as worthy objectives – these fields also constitute the foundations of our security. The Member States should share their good experiences and learn from one another to improve their weak sides. At the same time, geographical, cultural, and historical peculiarities of the Member States should be taken into account better when implementing directives and other action plans. Thus, Member States should also remain responsible for establishing direct taxes and resolving issues of education.

Public Trust towards National Parliaments in European Countries*

Andres Reiljan, Winner of August Rei Scholarship in Parliamentary Studies in 2013 The aim of this article was to determine which variables and to what extent influence people's trust towards national parliaments. I concentrated on parliament, as it is perceived as a central political institution, a cornerstone and a symbol of democracy. Thus, attitudes towards parliament should indicate the general legitimacy of the political system. I took a multidimensional perspective towards political trust, considering it to be a result of an interplay between individual and system level, as well as exogenous and endogenous (in relation to political system) variables. Individual evaluations of regime performance are placed in the centre of the theoretical model for explaining trust in parliament constructed in the article, expecting them to mediate the effect of system level variables and exogenous individual level variables. In the empirical analysis I used up-to-date data from 26 democratic European countries, collected in 2012 to 2013 by European Social Survey. Also, macro indicators of regime performance are used. Empirical results confirm that trust towards parliaments is higher in countries where the living standard is higher and which are perceived to be less corrupt. Problems with fiscal discipline have a negative effect on trust, starting from a certain threshold. GDP per capita, corruption perception index and a dummy variable for countries that have had an international bailout altogether explain 85% of the variance of average trust scores among countries. At the individual level, results indicate that people with higher education and higher satisfaction

with their household income, who are interested in politics and prioritize democracy highly, support government parties and are satisfied with the political and economic performance of the regime have higher trust towards parliament. Dominant variable in the model is satisfaction with the economic situation in the country. The unique effect of it is more than three times the size of any other variable. Thus, I also studied which variables determine satisfaction with the regime's economic performance. I found that it was very strongly related to country level variables, as more than one third of the variation among individuals is attributable to country level. Also, people who are not coping with their present income perceive state economy as being in worse shape. It is noteworthy that if egocentric and sociotropic economic evaluations are included in the same model to explain individual trust towards parliament, the former loses almost all of its effect. It is clear that there is a big overlap between the effect of these two variables on institutional trust. Thus, it is shown that sociotropic economic perceptions mediate the effect of objective regime performance and also individual living conditions, giving empirical support to the theoretical model presented in the article. Running the individual level model separately with Estonian data, results generally match the pan-European tendencies, with one important exception: in Estonia, people who belong to ethnic minorities show significantly less trust towards parliament. * Peer reviewed research paper.

STUDIES

Smartness of Estonian Entrepreneurship According to GEM and GEDI Studies of Entrepreneurship

Tiit Elenurm, Head of Department of Entrepreneurship, Estonian Business School
Rivo Riistop, Project Manager, Estonian Development Fund
The article deals with the findings of the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor (GEM) Estonia Report and the analysis of the Global Entrepreneurship Development Index (GEDI) that focus on promoting the development of innovative enterprises with growth ambitions and increasing their share in total entrepreneurial activity. The article discusses what are the obstacles to development of such enterprises today, and also what are the possibilities for supporting their growth while taking into consideration different entrepreneurial aspirations. Global Entrepreneurship Monitor is the largest annual study of entrepreneurial activity and attitudes at the level of individuals in the world. In 2014 Estonia participated in the assessment for the third time. This article analyses the results of the 2013 report, among other things in comparison to the first year of study. The Global Entrepreneurship Development Index was conducted in Estonia from autumn 2013 to autumn 2014. The study regards the ecosystem of Estonian entrepreneurship as a single whole, and identifies the developmental needs of Estonian business environment by comparing it with 120 countries and also different groups of states. The article draws attention to the main bottlenecks in the ecosystem of startups and the proposals for alleviating them, these issues are discussed in more detail in the full text of the report. The article explains the obstacles of innovative entrepreneurship by linking the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor and GEDI analyses. It is shown whose advice innovative entrepreneurs listen to, and who were the ambitious and less ambitious entrepreneurs in the GEM study of 2013. The development paths and cooperation possibilities of entrepreneurial organisations are compared. The article also discusses how to apply the recommendations of GEDI analysis, taking into account

the growth ambitions and entrepreneurial aspirations of entrepreneurs. The plan of the Estonian Development Fund to develop the ecosystem of startup companies through the Startup Estonia programme is also mentioned. The authors of the article believe that the results of the studies give an appropriate overview of the development obstacles of the ecosystem of Estonian entrepreneurship and startups, and will hopefully be actively used as the basic information in designing the support instruments of entrepreneurship.

Popularisation of e-Elections among Estonian Voters

Kristjan Vassil, University of Tartu, Institute of Government and Politics, Researcher **Mihkel Solvak**, University of Tartu, Institute of Government and Politics, Researcher **Priit Vinkel** Tallinn University of Technology, postgraduate student E-voting may potentially lower participation thresholds and increase turnout, but its technical complexity may pose other barriers to participation. Using Rogers' theory of the diffusion of innovations, we examine how the usage of e-voting has changed over time. We use data on six e-enabled elections in Estonia between 2005 and 2013 to contrast the profile of e-voters with those voting by conventional means. The aggregate number of e-voters has continually increased, with one third of all voters casting their vote from a distance, over the Internet in 2014. We examine whether the increase in user numbers is an indication of a non-random technologically savvy subpopulation who has fully adopted the technology, after which no further increase in user numbers is to be expected, or of a true technological diffusion process with very diverse voter groups adopting the e-voting technology. The survey data spanning a period of eight years shows that voters who voted over the internet for the first time at any of the six elections are increasingly less distinguishable from regular paper ballot voters, suggesting that the popularisation process is indeed taking place. To put it in a nutshell, whereas a host of socio-demographic and attitudinal traits did distinguish regular voters from e-voters during the first three e-enabled elections, this is no longer the case. This means that to all intents and purposes e-voters today are essentially interchangeable with regular paper ballot voters and that statistical models are no longer able to predict who is more or less likely to vote electronically. These findings suggest that e-voting has the potential of being widely used among all voters, not just by a technology savvy and socio-economically privileged subpopulation. We stress that this happened in the course of just three separate e-enabled elections conducted over a period of four years. We conclude that even though e-voting solutions will not start spreading immediately, this will take place in a comparatively short timeframe when potential users see the cost and convenience benefits of this mode of voting.

The Nations Who Live and Have Lived in Estonia

Ene-Margit Tiit, Professor Emeritus at the Faculty of Mathematics and Information Science of the University of Tartu, Chief Methodologist at Statistics Estonia Besides the Estonians, people of several other nationalities have lived on the territory of Estonia throughout its history. They have come and gone, and often these comings and goings have been violent and bloody, but in spite of everything the native people here, whose number in some periods has dwindled rather low, have preserved their own language and are an independent nation today. Many nations have perished in hundreds and thousands of years, and many of them have been

more numerous than the Estonians. Most probably this is the reason why nationality and native language have throughout history been very important for Estonians. In the course of history, the relations between the Estonians and the representatives of other nations who have lived here have been diverse, the sharpest conflict was between the German landlords and the Estonian countryside, which was however solved quite successfully during the first years of the Republic of Estonia. From the minority nations who have lived on the territory of Estonia since the old times, the Coastal Swedes, the Russians who lived near Lake Peipus, Jews and the Gypsies who travelled around here in summer should also be mentioned. As far as it is known, taking into account the printed records and oral recollections of those times, there was no hostility against other nations, and the attitude of Estonians towards the representatives of all other nations could be characterised as Nordic unemotional coolness. The situation changed radically during the World War II and after that. Most of the representatives of minority nations emigrated to their historical homelands at the beginning of the war or evacuated to the rear of the Soviet Union, during the last days of the war many Estonians left for Germany or Sweden. As a result of changing the borderline, most of Setumaa with its population became part of Russia. But from the moment the battles on the territory of Estonia ended, Estonia became an immigration destination and remained so for 45 years. The only year when the net migration rate (the difference between the number of immigrants and the number of emigrants) was negative was 1949, the year of great deportations. Among the immigrants there were also ethnic Estonians who had remained in Russia (Soviet Union) after the revolution of 1917. During the next 45 years the ethnic structure of the population of Estonia changed drastically. The number of immigrants was constantly increasing, most of them were Russians. Among them there were people who had been sent here to fulfil leading positions that were important to the state, and also to work in the mines that were of importance to the Soviet Union, especially in Sillamäe region. There were also those who came on their own free will, especially from the neighbouring regions that were heavily ravaged by the war, like Pskov region and the region around Leningrad. Besides Russians, also a great number of Ukrainians and Belarusians settled here, but in the course of time the range of the countries of origin increased, and the number of immigrants from the republics of Caucasus and Central Asia grew. At the same time it is important to note that the movement was never in one direction only, each year there was also a considerable number of leavers. Among those there were Estonians who went to Russia to study, or who had found attractive challenges in Russia. But still the net migration rate of Estonians was generally positive, and the number of Estonians grew steadily both due to those who returned to their homeland and the positive birth rate; the latter was greatly caused by having children at younger age. The baby boom that took place in most European countries after the war did not happen in Estonia. In the second half of the 1980s, the number of civilian population in Estonia was more than one and a half million. 61% of them were Estonians; among the rest, the Russians, Ukrainians and Belarusians dominated. The number of Finns (mostly Ingrians) was also relatively large. Altogether there were more than one hundred nationalities represented in Estonia, most of them from the Soviet Union. The number of military personnel is not known, but it was large. Immediately before and after the restoration of independence, a large part of the representatives of

other nations left Estonia, so that the percentage of Estonians increased to 68%. Estonia again became an emigration country, Finland became the main destination for Estonians, but there was also emigration to other Member States of the European Union, and to Australia and America. During the last 25 years the population of Estonia has decreased by 240,000. One third of this is due to negative birth rate and two thirds to negative net migration rate.

Integration in Estonia: Five Patterns with Different Weaves

Triin Vihalemm, Professor of Communication Studies, Head of Chair of Social Communication, Institute of Social Studies of the University of Tartu **Marianne Leppik**, Doctoral Candidate, Institute of Social Studies of the University of Tartu

The purpose of this article is to explore the socio-material factors reproducing different modes of involvement and shed some light on the prospects of their future development. The empirical basis of analysis was Integration Monitoring 2011 data. Authors made secondary analysis of the five patterns of involvement and identity that formed as clusters in the cluster analysis (Lauristin 2012, 198–203). In addition to comparing the clusters, we studied several regression models and analyzed which are the factors behind belonging to one or other cluster. Theoretical inspiration comes from structuration theory of Anthony Giddens (1984/1989). Different modes of involvement express interrelations between the structural provisions, institutional rules and personal resources. The aim of the analysis was to give answers to two questions: Is the potential agency of the people in a particular pattern realised through institutions or as social self-initiative at 'grass roots level'? Are the ethno-cultural identity and linguistic adaptation in mutually subordinating or mutually supporting positions? The pattern of assimilative adaptation is characterised by the high political and economic and moderate ethnolinguistic identity, and weaker "grass-roots" agency. Factors predicting belonging to this cluster are good knowledge of Estonian, consumption of the Estonian-language media and contacts with Estonians and also living outside ethnic concentration areas. Second pattern is characterized by strong pro-Estonia political involvement and rather moderate Estonian language skills. Members of this pattern have developed harmonious symbiosis of ethnic and civic loyalty. This pattern emerges more frequently among older people living in ethnic concentration areas and likely fades away with generation replacement. The third, ethnisation pattern can be characterized by low socio-economic mobility and political agency, which are (partly) compensated for by very strong ethno-cultural identity, enforced via common language, religion and spatially close networks. The above three patterns are rather "logical", so to say, institutionally prescribed alternatives in the context of Estonian nation building. However, our research revealed that altering patterns have also emerged. The "pragmatic involvement" bases more on the practical undergone experience somewhat distanced from the public communication flows. Members of this cluster have minimal ambitions and resources for participation in civil society. This pattern emerges more likely in the ethnic concentration areas and among pupils. The pattern of "critical activism" is characterised by active participation in the informal political actions and NGOs paired with the critical attitude towards state power(s). The members of relevant group have relatively good Estonian language skills but their contacts with ethnic Estonians are mediatized: they follow intensively Estonian language mass media but do not have many acquaintances among Estonians.

Russian-language Broadcasting in Estonia. From Yesterday to Today

Andres Jõesaar, Associate Professor of Crossmedia, Baltic Film and Media School of Tallinn University According to the public sphere conception of Habermas, communicative action is necessary for successful functioning of society. This article analyses the media sphere of Estonia, which is divided into two separate parts of information space by language – the Estonian-language media and the Russian-language media. The article claims that one reason why such a situation has emerged is the media policy of the Republic of Estonia. But its historical roots go deeper than the second independence period. In order to understand the Estonian media of today and to plan activities directed towards the future, it is necessary to analyse the steps and choices that have brought us to our present situation. Denis McQuail (2003) has said that media institutions are influenced by three forces: politics, technology and economics. At the same time with the drastic processes and events that took place in the Estonian society, the whole media landscape was also cardinally reformed in the beginning of the 1990s. Changes took place in several important aspects. New legislation guaranteed independence to media and created preconditions for the emergence of dual broadcasting system, economic models changed, technology was renewed. Due to the new media paradigm, the contents and priorities of media had to be redefined. Although technically these processes concerned the Estonian society as a whole, their results were significantly different for the Estonian-speaking and the Russian-speaking population. During the whole period after the restoration of independence, the Estonian media regulation has been minimalistic. There are no restrictions on establishing periodicals (including newspapers, portals). The legislation regulating the functioning of TV and radio channels is based on the Audiovisual Media Services Directive, which unfortunately does not take into account the smallness of our media market, and our cultural and historical peculiarities. According to national media policy, the interests of the Russian-speaking population were to be satisfied through private sector and Estonian Radio programme Raadio 4. Private sector has not achieved noteworthy success in serving the Russian audience. The content and diversity of genres of the Russian-language programmes offered by domestic media companies is minimal. The 101 channels in Russian that are retransmitted through the cable networks offer ample possibilities to those who wish for more. ETV2 that was opened in autumn of 2008 provided new possibilities for developing their programme strategy to national public broadcasting. After the events of the Bronze Night, the opening of Russian-language ETV2 was discussed both in public and in political circles, but no funds necessary for the opening of the channel were allocated in the state budget. In spite of that, ETV2 made it possible to offer more Russian-language programmes than before, first of all by retransmitting Estonian programmes with Russian subtitles. But in addition to daily news programme in Russian and reruns of Estonian-language programmes, the programme of ETV2 was also enriched by several programmes financed by funds outside the budget of the Estonian Public Broadcasting. In spite of the increased number of broadcasting hours in Russian and with Russian translation, significant increase in popularity among Russian audience was not achieved. The general viewability of ETV2 among non-Estonians remained modest. In order to include Russian-speaking population in the Estonian information space, it is necessary to make greater efforts than have been made so far, and this requires much bigger investments. Placing of Russian-language

programmes into an Estonian TV channel is not a solution for attracting the audience. The experience of ETV2 also shows that adding subtitles to Estonian programmes does not guarantee the expected result. The reason why subtitles did not work is not that the Russian audience prefers voice-over translation, but the content of these programmes. The programmes aired by the Estonian channels and the Estonian series do not deal with the life of the Russian-speaking community, their problems and achievements. At present there are no drama series, serious or entertaining talk shows and TV magazines made by non-Estonians on the Estonian TV landscape. There is no real contact with everyday life and living environment in Estonia. But it is this personal experience and contact that makes people to make choices on the landscape of TV channels. Unfortunately the Russian-speaking people living in Estonia do not have that possibility.

Russian Channel under the Fire of Unproved Theories

Ainar Ruusaar, Member of the Board of Estonian National Broadcasting The idea of creating a Russian-language media competence centre that would mainly have the function of mediating the life in Estonia and in Europe in the widest meaning of this concept to the Russian-speaking target group is discussed more and more in Estonia. Besides the traditional TV, the planned media tube would also include the traditional radio and also the web that has become an indispensable part of life. The Estonian media system reflects education and decent and safe living environment that is supported by its Estonian and also Russian content.

Transfer to Estonian as Language of Instruction in Russian-Medium Upper Secondary Schools

Jelena Rootamm-Valter, Lecturer at the Narva College of University of Tartu A partial transfer to Estonian as the language of instruction in Russian-medium upper secondary schools in Estonia started in the early 1990s and culminated in 2010. Some teachers who must switch to teaching in Estonian have previously taught in Russian. It is important to determine if there is a need for additional in-service teacher training during the transfer period, and if so, what kind of training is required. A model of teachers' professional competences was compiled and a training needs analysis was conducted among expert groups of teachers. Six Russian-medium upper secondary schools were selected for the study on the basis of the representativeness of the criteria set to focus groups. The representative groups were asked to evaluate the need for additional in-service training and, eventually, the need for language support by rating their professional competences. The data was analysed using the Spearman's correlation as well as the variations range of the three measured criteria at the level of several schools and their teaching staff, and at the level of mean indicator values. Research has failed to reveal any commonalities in either the strengths or the weaknesses of teachers' professional competences. Each school has a unique professional profile. The need for in-service professional training depends on the professional profile of each school (correlation 0.835–0.908). The need for language support is also highly correlated with the conscious need for training. Any plans for a partial transfer to instruction in the Estonian language, as well as for additional in-service training and language support should be based on the needs of individual schools. In order to carry out the partial transfer of Russian-medium schools to Estonian as the

language of instruction, it is absolutely vital to apply an individual approach to each and every school.

COSMOS

Estonia on the Way to Full Membership of the European Space Agency

Madis Võõras, Sectoral Manager of Estonian Space Office, Enterprise Estonia 2014 was the 50th anniversary of the establishment of the European Space Agency (ESA). In 2014, the accession negotiations of Estonia with the ESA will be concluded, and in 2015 Estonia may become a full-fledged member of the ESA. The article gives a brief overview of the ESA, an intergovernmental organisation that today has 20 member states. The ESA functions on the basis of the ESA Convention of 1975, where the rights and obligations of its members are outlined. The ESA Convention has turned out to be such a good document that after its founding, practically no changes have been made to it. New member states join the Convention. In many issues the ESA member states have equal right to vote, regardless of their contribution to the ESA budget. Important decisions are adopted on the basis of consensus. Another special feature of the ESA is its industrial policy, according to which orders are placed to the enterprises of member states proportionally to the participation of that country to the ESA budget. At the same time the contracts in ESA procurements are awarded on the basis of open invitations to tender, in order to ascertain the best offer. The ESA has managed to implement these two seemingly contradicting principles successfully, guaranteeing in this way the development of high technology economy and space industry in Europe. The ESA with its 2000 employees is a good example of how European countries can cooperate in such a demanding sphere as space and its applications. Estonia has been developing relations with the ESA since 2006. Why should Estonia join the ESA and what will it give us? Joining the ESA has both direct and indirect impact on Estonia. The direct impact is first of all high technology orders to Estonian companies and the agencies of the Estonian Academy of Sciences. This could also be called institutional export. A precondition for institutional export is that Estonia as a country is a member of the relevant institution. The space industry does not exist on its own but generates as its indirect impact the so-called supplementary revenue: orders to subcontractors, technology transfer to land-based economy, etc. The analyses conducted in several countries show that the turnover multiplier ranges between 2 (Portugal) and 6 (Norway). Cooperation with the ESA is not an aim in itself, but should be seen as a preparatory stage for the cooperation of Estonian entrepreneurs with the space industry companies of Europe (and the world). In cooperation with a large institution it is possible to develop the necessary competencies and capabilities, and to establish contacts with companies. Membership status in the European Space Agency is an acknowledgement to the capability and ambitions of a country in space research, and would be a sign of belonging to the sharpest top of European research and development work. Estonia has reached the final stage of becoming a member state of the ESA. Our cooperation, which has lasted eight years already, has shown that we have something to give to the ESA and we can get something from the ESA. It would be sensible for Estonia as a small country to realise its space ambitions in cooperation with the ESA, by developing both essential and administrative capacity. If the result of that is high-paying jobs, new ambitious companies, increasing high technology export, then the expenses are

justified. Space has always been an inspiration for the young people of Estonia, already since the sixties of the last century. Being a member of the ESA will certainly help to accomplish some of these dreams.

Estonia Has Become a Space State

Ene Ergma, Member of the Riigikogu, Vice-Chairperson of the Pro Patria and Res Publica Union Estonia is not a newcomer in space research. In the middle of the last century, the scientists from the Estonian Academy of Sciences and universities participated in several space programmes of the Soviet Union, but when Estonia restored its independence, this close cooperation was discontinued. A new attempt to join the space states began in 2006, when the Space Policy Working Group was established. Its main task was to analyse if Estonia has the capability to work in the field of space research, especially the space economy, and develop high technology trends. It was understood in Europe already 50 years ago that nowadays no country, and especially a small country, is able to develop its space capabilities by itself, and the European Space Agency (ESA), where only states can be members, was established. The most outstanding project of Estonia during the new period of space cooperation is without doubt the building of the student satellite ESTCube-1 and launching it to the space on the ESA launch vehicle Vega-1. This event was widely covered both in Estonian and the international media, and thanks to the successful start, Estonia became the 42nd space state in the world. Why did I for nine years involve myself in helping Estonian young people participate in programmes connected with space research? As a professor of the University of Tartu I understood that it is my duty to give young people as many possibilities as I can. The possibility to deal with space research is one of them. Thanks to my position in Estonian political life, it was easier for me to prove the politicians that it is very necessary that Estonia would be one of the space states. I believe that it is the role of the state to offer people possibilities, and it is the task of the people to realise them. When Estonia becomes a member of the European Space Agency, Estonia and its talented young people will have new paths for developing and implementing of space technologies.

LITERATURE AND DATABASES

Overview of the 25 Years of Work of the Parliamentary Library

Karmen Linask, Head of the Parliamentary Information Centre, Estonian National Library This autumn 25 years passed from the day the Supreme Council of the Estonian SSR restored the status of the Estonian National Library as the parliamentary library, and together with it, its honourable task to provide information services to the parliament and the government. The Parliamentary Information Department whose function was to serve the parliament was founded in 1991. On 1 September of that year, the Reading Room with its collection of essential legal and political literature was opened in the Riigikogu building. At present the Parliamentary Information Centre has 35 workers and six working groups: reference information, international organisations, legal information, economic and political information, European Union and publications working groups. Often the parliamentary library is also the central legal library of the country, which requires strong legal collection in the form of both books and data bases. According to the law, the role of the parliamentary library is also to act as the deposit library of international organisations; the National Library is the

deposit library of 13 international organisations. In the middle of the 1990s, the compilation of several databases of articles began; these databases were accessible from the computers in the house. From 2009, the article items have been entered into the Internet-based data base ISE (ise.elnet.ee). The Parliamentary Information Centre is responsible for social sciences. Until today, the databases Parliamentarism and Bibliographia Iuridica Estonica are supplemented. Besides that, the database of the bibliography of the President of the Republic is compiled. On 1 October 2014, the National Library opened a new portal DIGAR Eesti ajalehed (DIGAR Estonian Newspapers) that connects the bibliographic database and full texts. With the help of a modern and user-friendly user application, it is possible to search for publications and articles published in newspapers, read full texts, add keywords to articles, draw up lists of found articles, send data to e-mail and share received information through social web.